

MCAS Released Item  
Grade 5 2019

For this question, you will write an essay based on the passage(s). Your writing should:

- Present and develop a central idea.
- Provide evidence and/or details from the passage(s).
- Use correct grammar, spelling, and punctuation.

Based on the passage and the poem, write an essay that explains how Catalina's and the student's feelings about their futures are similar. Be sure to use information from the passage **and** the poem to develop your essay.

**Topic:** Feelings about the Future

**Main Idea #1:** know exactly what they want

**Main Idea #2:** determined

**Main Idea #3:** hopeful

This student understands the organization of a piece of exposition. Through the use of the detail generating questions to pull out important evidence and then explain that evidence, this was an effective piece. This Score Point 4 paper is a great example of the application of the EW skills.

**What worked:**

- **Organization:** This piece includes an introduction, three main ideas and a conclusion following the pillar structure. The writer presents a central idea and develops the main ideas to support that central idea - how the main characters feel about their future. It was clear that the student understood the purpose for the writing.
- **Main Ideas:** The student included main ideas that were distinct from one another, and wrote a main idea sentence for each paragraph as the first sentence to focus the reader, however the main idea sentences are simplistic in nature.
- **Sentence Structure/Word Choice:** the student used some interesting sentence variety and word choice: "she continued to wonder and wish, he is being optimistic"
- **Elaboration:** The author was able to include elaboration through the use of the detail generating questions - What does it look like? And Why is it important? In this response

to text, the detail generating questions provide a frame for locating specific evidence and explaining that evidence. What does it look like to be determined? The student writes, “In Lace Round the Sky, in paragraph 7 after Catalina says that she wants to be an astronomer, her father says, “Maybe if you work hard, you’ll be hired to clean the offices when you’re big enough, like your mother.” The writer goes on to explain why this is important, “But instead of giving up her dream she continued to wonder and wish.” This type of evidence and explanation are woven into each paragraph.

- **Introduction and Conclusion:** The introduction paragraph established the topic by turning the prompt into the response and then outlines the main ideas in the piece through a topic sentence. The conclusion re-stated the prompt and the main ideas. These “bookends” provided coherence to the piece.
- **Transitions:** There were transitions within each paragraph that made it easy to read, however they were redundant in nature and the writing could certainly be enhanced using creative transitions and main idea sentence starters.

Compare/Contrast Grid

List elements for comparison here

	Source #1	Source #2

The student did a great job using details from each selection in order to show the similarities of their feelings. The grid above is a helpful tool in helping students to organize their thoughts. Using the grid: the source texts would be listed at the top and the main ideas down the side. By determining main ideas, the student can easily compare the texts within the main idea paragraphs instead of trying to write about one text, then the other, and finally to compare. This is a much more effective organizational structure to a compare/contrast essay.

**See Section 3 Lesson 11 for more background on compare/contrast and a specific lesson plan along with sentence starters.**

### Feedback with Prescriptive Lesson:

#### CHOOSE a Focus Skill

**Main Ideas/Reasons:** The student would benefit from lessons on developing main ideas sentences that are creative and adding additional high level vocabulary.

**Section 2 Lesson 10 and 11** Alternatives to Boring, Redundant Main Idea Sentences

**Section 2 Lesson 15** Word Referents

**Elaboration:** The student would benefit by practicing how to state evidence through the use of creative sentence starters and to paraphrase in their own words at times.

**Section 3 Lesson 12** Paraphrasing

**Section 3 Lesson 13** Giving the Author Credit

**Transitional Words and Phrases:** Section 4 Lesson 11

**2019 MCAS**  
**Grade 5 English Language Arts**  
**Question 17**

**Idea Development - Score Point 4**

The essay clearly and fully develops the central idea that Catalina's and the student's feelings about their futures are similar. This is evidenced in the first paragraph: "They both feel like they know exactly what they want, feel very determined to reach their goals, and feel hopeful." The central idea is developed using effective and varied evidence from both the passage and the poem. For example, the writer quotes Catalina saying, "I want to be an astronomer when I grow up," and from the poem, "And said with pride and confidence, I plan to live in space." Additional evidence supports the idea that Catalina and the student are determined and hopeful for their futures, including this description of Catalina: "But, instead of giving up her dream she continued to wonder and wish." The essay is organized effectively as the topic is clearly introduced, and ideas are expressed within paragraphs with a skillful use of appropriate transitions: "First of all," "Also," "Finally," and "As you can see." The conclusion restates the topic and clearly summarizes the main points, demonstrating a full awareness of the purpose for writing.

**Standard English Conventions - Score Point 3**

The essay demonstrates consistent control of a variety of sentence structures, as shown in this example: "Also, they both feel very determined. In *Lace Round the Sky*, in paragraph 7 after Catalina says that she wants to be an astronomer, her father says. . . ." Proper punctuation of evidence from the passage and the poem is consistent throughout the essay. While there are a few minor errors, they do not detract from overall understanding. Based on its length and complexity, the writing demonstrates consistent control of Standard English conventions for this grade level.

The girl, Catalina Solis, and the student have similar feelings about their futures. They both feel like they know exactly what they want, feel very determined to reach their goals, and feel hopeful.

First of all, they both feel like they know exactly what they want to be when they grow up. Catalina wants to be an astronomer. On paragraph 15 of *Lace Round the Sky*, she says, "I want to be an astronomer when I grow up." She was positive about it, saying that without any doubt. The student knew exactly what he wanted to be too. In *One Day I'll Be*, he announced to the teacher on lines 7 - 8, "And said with pride and confidence, I plan to live in space." Not only did he want to pursue his dreams, he was confident about it.

Also, they both feel very determined. In *Lace Round the Sky*, in paragraph 7 after Catalina says that she wants to be an astronomer, her father says, "Maybe if you work hard, you'll be hired to clean the offices when you're big enough, like your mother." But, instead of giving up her dream she continued to wonder and wish. For example, in paragraph 8 it says, "But Catalina was curious. The sky did not merely consist of white dots of stars against a black background, like her schoolbooks said." The student was also determined. In stanza 2 he says, "Right then and there I stood straight up, and looked her in the face, and said with pride and confidence, I plan to live in space." He is determined to live in space, no matter what people say.

Finally, they both feel hopeful about their dreams. Catalina feels hopeful about her future when she receives the letter from the astronomer. On paragraph 54, it says, "She clutched the letter to her chest, an absurd joy exploding like a supernova. It was going to happen. She would become an astronomer. She knew it now." She is so excited and hopeful about her future and her dreams coming reality. Also, the student is hopeful. On lines 11 and 12, he says, "Around the moon and back again, and to a distant star." He is being optimistic, hoping that it will happen.

As you can see, Catalina and the student share many feelings about their futures. They are sure of what they want. They are strong and determined, and refuse to give up. And they are hopeful about the future, whatever happens.



Turn the prompt into the response

Introduction

The girl, Catalina Solis, and the student have similar feelings about their futures. They both feel like they know exactly what they want, feel very determined to reach their goals, and feel hopeful.

Topic sentence that outlines the main ideas

they know what they want

First of all, they both feel like they know exactly what they want to be when they grow up. Catalina wants to be an astronomer. On paragraph 15 of *Lace Round the Sky*, she says, "I want to be an astronomer when I grow up." She was positive about it, saying that without any doubt. The student knew exactly what he wanted to be too. In *One Day I'll Be*, he announced to the teacher on lines 7 - 8, "And said with pride and confidence, I plan to live in space." Not only did he want to pursue his dreams, he was confident about it.

cite evidence explain

determined

Also, they both feel very determined. In *Lace Round the Sky*, in paragraph 7 after Catalina says that she wants to be an astronomer, her father says, "Maybe if you work hard, you'll be hired to clean the offices when you're big enough, like your mother." But, instead of giving up her dream she continued to wonder and wish. For example, in paragraph 8 it says, "But Catalina was curious. The sky did not merely consist of white dots of stars against a black background, like her schoolbooks said." The student was also determined. In stanza 2 he says, "Right then and there I stood straight up, and looked her in the face, and said with pride and confidence, I plan to live in space." He is determined to live in space, no matter what people say.

cite explain cite explain

hopeful

cite

Finally, they both feel hopeful about their dreams. Catalina feels hopeful about her future when she receives the letter from the astronomer. On paragraph 54, it says, "She clutched the letter to her chest, an absurd joy exploding like a supernova. It was going to happen. She would become an astronomer. She knew it now." She is so excited and hopeful about her future and her dreams coming reality. Also, the student is hopeful. On lines 11 and 12, he says, "Around the moon and back again, and to a distant star." He is being optimistic, hoping that it will happen.

cite explain

restate prompt

As you can see, Catalina and the student share many feelings about their futures. They are sure of what they want. They are strong and determined, and refuse to give up. And they are hopeful about the future, whatever happens.

reiterate the main ideas

Conclusion

[ 4 Points | 4 Points | 3 Points | 2 Points | 1 Point | 0 Points ]

Cite evidence - use the detail generating question  
"What does it look like?"Explain your thinking - use the detail generating question  
"Why is it important?"